



Implementation of Portfolio Assessment in English Lessons at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi

Sultanuddin¹, Saharudin², Martinis Yamin³, Vesna Waite⁴, Lekh Nath Baral⁵
^{1,2,3}Magister Teknologi Pendidikan, Pascasarjana Universitas Jambi, Jambi, Indonesia
⁴English Language Teacher, Private School of English Doroty, Niš, Serbia
⁵Norwegian National Centre for English and Other Foreign Languages in Education
Corresponding author email: asultanuddinsuldiin@gmail.com

Info Article

Received: 18 Jan 2023
Revised: 18 Feb 2023
Accepted: 19 Mar 2023
Online Version: 20 Apr 2023

Abstract

This research aims to: 1) obtain an overview of portfolio assessment planning for English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi, 2) describe the implementation of portfolio assessment for English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi. 3) describe the advantages and obstacles of portfolio assessment in English language learning at MAN Human Cendekia Jambi. The approach used in this research is qualitative research. The results of the research show that portfolio assessment planning in English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi includes several components, such as: educator preparation, consideration of the values that will be applied, and determining appropriate learning material. Apart from that, the assessment also includes students' affective aspects which aim to form good student attitudes in accordance with the Islamic boarding school concept. The implementation of portfolio assessment in English language learning also experiences obstacles, namely limited time, different student characteristics, and institutional support regarding portfolio assessment that is not yet well systemized. Portfolio assessment in English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi includes: evidence of thought processes, quality of activities, and diversity of approaches. The implementation of portfolio assessment in English lessons at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi shows the school's commitment to improving students' learning experience holistically. This research has the potential to provide new insights regarding the effectiveness of alternative evaluation methods in the context of English language education.

Keywords: English; Evaluation; Implementation; Portfolio

This is open access article under the [CC-BY](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) licence



INTRODUCTION

In learning, the following three things must be mastered by a teacher, namely the curriculum, the learning process, and the assessment system, and all three must be mastered in a balanced manner (Asari, 2021; Razman et al., 2022). To find out whether this competency has been achieved, a tool

called evaluation is needed (Cruz et al., 2020; Wong, 2020). In evaluation, it is necessary to distinguish between these two things, namely measurement and assessment or interpretation (Palm, 2008). Measurement occurs when a teacher, with questions he creates, or assignments he gives, asks students to do it, then corrects it, and gives a score for the students' work. To be able to measure correctly, you also need the correct measuring tools (Dachliyani, 2019; Mokkink et al., 2020). The correct measuring instrument must meet the requirements: authentic (valid), steady (reliable), and practical

Assessment of learning outcomes in the 2013 curriculum using authentic assessment includes assessments based on observations, field assignments, projects, products, journals, laboratory work and performance, as well as self-assessment (Marfuah & Febriza, 2019; Ozan, 2019; Syaravina et al., 2019). This assessment is a factor in the learning process and also has an influence on the language learning process which includes listening, speaking, reading and writing skills (Aziezah, 2022; Padmawati et al., 2019). The four language skills have a very close relationship and are one unit, because they support each other to create good communication (Brødsgaard et al., 2019; Kurniawan et al., 2020). In order to be able to speak, sufficient vocabulary is needed which is acquired through reading and listening (Biyansyahna & Maulana, 2020). If someone does not listen well then the possibility of misunderstanding will be high.

Therefore, in learning English it is very important to strive for improvements in the learning and teaching process by considering the following things: (1) reduce students' dependence on teachers so that students become independent and active, (2) it is necessary to monitor the writing improvement process systematically, where this monitoring can guarantee the quality of the product, (3) there is a need for evidence of the learning process and results to be stored neatly and easy to retrieve.

Portfolio assessment is a form of collection of student work/assignments over a certain period of time that shows their mastery of knowledge, skills and attitudes (Fauzi, 2020). Portfolio assessment in the teaching field is still relatively new so there are still many teachers who have not been able to implement it in the classroom (Poerwanti & Winarni, 2021). A portfolio can be a collection of assignments, work results or student work related to the material and subjects they study at school (Magdalena et al., 2021). These assignments are given in such a way as to reflect the development of students' abilities and competencies.

In Minister of Education and Culture regulation number 66 of 2013, it is stated that assessment is a process of collecting and processing information to measure student learning outcomes including: authentic assessment, self-assessment, portfolio-based assessment, tests, daily tests, mid-semester tests, final semester tests. Assessments carried out by teaching units include competency level exams and school and/madrasah exams (Sukenti et al., 2021).

In this research the author will try to research one of the elements of assessment that is currently being discussed, namely portfolio assessment. The author believes and believes that not all madrasahs can implement portfolio assessment well even though the madrasah is already a superior madrasah at the national madrasah standard. MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi strives for a fully implemented assessment process to record student progress in learning systemically and comprehensively, both cognitively, attitudes and skills. In skills assessment, one of the components of which is a portfolio assessment, there are still many weaknesses, namely the existence of several indicators that lead to the implementation of portfolio assessment not being optimal, including complaints from parents about student grades, inconsistent student grades even though the student is an outstanding student. , there are striking differences in scores for the same students by different teachers in different semesters even though overall student achievement is stable.

Previous research conducted by (Chugai et al., 2021) regarding the peculiarities of language portfolio implementation in the teaching process, the results showed that students were ready to be involved in the language portfolio preparation process because they understood the importance of this for the promotion of their careers. They agree that thanks to the language portfolio, they get complete information about their level of language proficiency, which can be shown to potential employers. The novelty of the current research is that this research offers a new approach in implementing portfolio assessment in English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi by exploring its effectiveness

in improving students' understanding and language skills.

Research on the implementation of portfolio assessment in English lessons at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi urges evaluating the effectiveness of this method in improving students' understanding of the material as well as identifying the potential for improving language skills. This study is important because it can provide an in-depth view of the impact of using portfolio assessment in the context of English learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi, enabling the development of more effective strategies to improve the quality of teaching and learning. The impact of this research is that this research has the potential to provide valuable insights for the development of more holistic and effective evaluation strategies in the context of English language learning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi.

Based on the description and problems above, the researcher intends to describe the portfolio assessment at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Insan Cendekia Jambi. Thus the title of this research is "Implementation of Portfolio Assessment in English Lessons at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi".

RESEARCH METHODS

Research Type

This research is a qualitative descriptive study, namely research that tries to describe a phenomenon holistically (Ho & Devi, 2020; Muzari et al., 2022). This research aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of a phenomenon. Specifically, it focuses on elucidating the implementation of portfolio assessment within English lessons at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi. Through detailed analysis and description, this research endeavors to offer insights into the effectiveness, challenges, and potential improvements of portfolio assessment in this educational context, contributing to the broader discourse on assessment practices in language learning environments.

Research Sites

This research took place at MAN Cendekia Jambi. The research location was chosen because MAN Cendekia is one of the most favorite schools in Jambi Province which has a strict curriculum so it is predicted to have an established learning system and curriculum and has implemented portfolio assessment in every lesson. The subjects of this research were students at MAN Cendekia Jambi, especially students who took English subjects because the researcher was an English teacher.

Data Collection Technique

The data in this research is primary data obtained directly from data sources in the form of observations and interviews with resource persons. Data sources in this research are people, places, events, and school documentation. Data sources in the form of people are data sources in the form of informants who can provide information directly or indirectly regarding research data. Sources of this data include, for example, students, teachers, school principals and other interested parties. Data collection in this research was carried out by direct field observation, interviews, and document review. The researcher carried out three stages of data collection, namely initial data collection through pre-research activities, the second stage of data collection, and the third stage was data analysis and verification as well as completing the remaining data.

In this research, the researcher acts as a data collection tool. As a data collector, the researcher prepared research instruments used by researchers for field observations, in-depth interviews, and collecting school documents. Data collection through observation was carried out to understand the data context as a whole. Apart from that, with observation activities researchers can discover things that were not revealed during the interview. Data collection through interviews is intended to obtain information from research participants about their thoughts, knowledge, feelings and experiences related to the research theme. The researcher conducted a semi-structured interview, where the researcher had prepared a research instrument in the form of an interview guide, namely written questions. The interviewer still provides opportunities for the interviewee to express his opinions and ideas without alternative answers

with the aim of finding problems more openly. Researchers also review documents, namely records of events which can be in the form of writing, drawings or monumental works by someone.

Data collection tools in this research are divided into observation sheets (direct field observations), interview guides (interviews). Observation sheet is a tool used to collect individual or group data, but the data is not taken directly by the individual or group concerned. Observation sheets are used to see the performance or attitudes of individuals and groups on something. Interview guidelines are a guideline used by data takers in asking questions to respondents/sources. This is usually made in the form of a grid or indicator so that during the interview the questioner does not ask things out of context. The interview guide was created based on the Portfolio implementation grid as in Table 1.

Table 1. Portfolio Assessment Implementation Grid

No.	Indicator	Sub Indicator
1	Portfolio assessment planning	a. School readiness in carrying out portfolio assessments b. Preparations made by teachers to carry out portfolio assessments c. Syllabus and learning process design for portfolio assessment d. Student readiness in carrying out portfolio assessments e. The teacher's ability to carry out portfolio assessments
2	Implementation of portfolio assessment	a. Portfolio assessment planning in learning b. Implementation of portfolio assessment in learning c. Portfolio assessment process in learning
3	Portfolio assessment assessment	a. How to assess using portfolio assessment b. Time for carrying out portfolio assessment c. Suitability of measuring instruments with the results to be achieved d. Use of assessment rubrics in assessing portfolios
4	Barriers to implementing portfolio assessment	a. Obstacles encountered in carrying out portfolio assessment b. How to overcome obstacles in portfolio assessment

Data Analysis Technique

This research uses data triangulation where there is several data from various methods and the results will be compared and analyzed so that conclusions can be drawn about the thing being studied. This research uses various research instruments specifically created to look at the implementation of portfolio assessment from various sides, both from the student, teacher and school side. The triangulation method used is expected to produce more valid and reliable data.

Activities in data analysis are data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification, while the research steps include the pre-field stage, field stage and reporting stage.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results of this research provide three stages in portfolio assessment, including the assessment planning stage, assessment implementation and portfolio assessment evaluation. Each stage is analyzed by researchers based on data obtained in the field from each available source.

1. Portfolio planning

Portfolio planning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi includes several components such as selecting teacher preparation, considering the values that will be applied, and determining appropriate subject matter. In planning portfolio assessment in English subjects, teachers apply the assessment of learning

processes and outcomes at the same time. The teacher prepares an assessment system and learning tools which include Learning Plans and Learning Units. The preparation of the assessment system as one with the syllabus is influenced by the ability or competency of the English subject teacher. Preparation of the syllabus at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi according to the 2013 Curriculum. The assessment system is integrated with the syllabus, containing assessments which include types of bills, forms of bills and examples of instruments. By having examples of these instruments, it will make it easier for teachers to create question instruments, by developing examples of these instruments.

One example of an instrument related to portfolio assessment is group assignments (Cintia et al., 2018; Nartiya et al., 2022). In group assignments, the teacher prepares actual themes that will be discussed as discussion material (Amnie, 2018; Chinta et al., 2016). The teacher previously discussed the theme with the students, about what theme would be used as a theme in the discussion. The teacher also prepares indicators of student learning activity consisting of 8 student indicators, which include students' courage to appear in front of the class, ability to ask questions, ability to respond to answers, ability to give suggestions or opinions, ability to accept suggestions, ability to have opinions, ability to refute answers, and the ability to answer questions included in the observation sheet.

Based on the results of an observation questionnaire to teachers at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi, the majority of respondents stated that the school was ready to implement portfolio assessment. Of the 15 teacher respondents who were observed, all of them stated that the school was ready because portfolios are an assessment that is often implemented in the school. This was also reinforced by interviews conducted with teachers at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi, most of whom responded positively to efforts to prepare portfolio assessments. Not only from the school, readiness also comes from the teacher as proven by the results of the questionnaire. The average questionnaire results show that each teacher has differences in terms of assessment but both follow existing procedures. Portfolio assessment has been implemented in the form of performance assessment so that teachers are ready to carry out this assessment.

2. Implementation of portfolio assessment

After the planning stage, teachers and schools begin to apply portfolio assessment in learning. The teacher provides a portfolio assessment after carrying out the learning process in class by giving assignments to students both independently and in a guided manner. This collection of assignments will be combined to see student progress during learning.

In implementing portfolio assessment, teachers apply the principles of assessing learning outcomes and processes. The learning process that is assessed is obtained from structured assignments, which can take the form of working on practice questions contained in the LKS, and making group papers to be presented in front of the class. This worksheet is given to students after students have completed one topic. By making group papers, students will be encouraged to look for paper materials by coming to the school library and reading reference books or newspapers or magazines to complete the assignment. Teachers also create guidelines for assessing student activity to make assessment easier during discussions. Assessment of learning outcomes and remedial programs is given to students and included in a collection of assignments and tests for portfolios so that teachers can see the extent of student progress during lessons, including the development of student abilities.

3. Evaluate portfolio assessment

After the implementation stage of the portfolio assessment has been carried out, after the portfolio assignments have been collected the teacher will evaluate the portfolio assessment that has been carried out to see whether it has gone smoothly or whether there were any obstacles during its implementation. Portfolio assessment at MAN Cendekia Jambi has an individual evaluation, meaning that portfolio assessment evaluations are carried out in different ways by each teacher, but still follow standard assessment procedures. This is reinforced by the results of an open questionnaire from teachers, most of whom said that the portfolio assessment method at MAN Cendekia Jambi had been implemented well, but it was more about the way each teacher implemented it.

The measuring instruments used in portfolio assessment are considered appropriate by the teachers who implement this assessment. Almost all teacher respondents responded to this through an open questionnaire given by researchers. In terms of the use of assessment rubrics, teachers at MAN Cendekia Jambi use rubrics that have been determined from the syllabus and lesson plans that have been created. As for the details, there are differences in application for each teacher because what is stated in the syllabus is only in outline.

From planning to evaluation, the implementation of portfolio assessment has various obstacles or obstacles, including differences in the implementation of portfolio assessment for each teacher even though in general the procedure is almost the same. Most of the respondents provided input about the existing obstacles, namely that teachers could be more innovative in making portfolio assessments and could coordinate with other teacher colleagues in implementing portfolio assessments so that portfolio assessments could be implemented optimally at MAN Cendekia Jambi. Apart from the obstacles mentioned above, there are also several other obstacles based on researcher observations and teacher recognition when implementing portfolio assessment in learning through interviews. These obstacles include the following time constraints: time constraints are something that teachers often experience in implementing portfolio assessments for students during learning. Based on the results of interviews with English subject teachers at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi, the time available to complete administration in order to carry out portfolio assessments and report to madrasahs, parents, committees and related agencies is very limited. As a boarding madrasah, teachers not only carry out the tasks that teachers do in regular madrasahs, but teachers have other duties and responsibilities such as being foster parents, accompanying students at night and doing tutorials. The large number of tasks carried out by teachers means that they cannot focus fully on portfolio assessment so that implementation is still constrained by a lack of time.

Diverse student characters: each student has a different level of understanding in the learning process. Not all students have the courage to participate actively during learning activities. There are some students who actively participate in the learning process, but there are some students who tend to be passive or participate less. Besides students having different understanding and absorption capacities, students also come from different social and cultural backgrounds. This makes portfolio assessment problematic because teachers must be able to make students participate actively during learning because portfolio assessment prioritizes student activity. Teachers must be able to invite students to participate in portfolio assessments so that students' progress during learning can be seen.

Unequal understanding: all teachers are familiar with portfolio assessment. But do not yet understand the substance of portfolio assessment. Many teachers still understand portfolio assessment narrowly. So in reporting student success, portfolio assessment cannot be implemented optimally. Lack of human resources for teachers, especially for English subjects: with the large number of study groups at MAN Insan Cendekia, namely 15 classes and adjusted to the available mandatory teaching hours and cross-interest, it does not match the number of available English teachers, namely 2 people.

CONCLUSION

Portfolio assessment consists of planning, implementing and evaluating the portfolio assessment. Portfolio assessment planning at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi begins with the teacher preparation process, considering the grades to be applied, as well as determining the appropriate subject matter. The planning process is carried out in several steps, including determining objectives, formulating content aspects, determining the form and type of bill, and determining the use of the portfolio. In the implementation step, things carried out include process assessments, making short stories in English, practicing singing songs in English, holding discussions and presentations and making videos in English. Next there is an evaluation stage where there are still several obstacles such as time, student character, lack of understanding and lack of teacher human resources.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to express our deep appreciation for the contributions of this research. Thank you for the dedication and hard work you have contributed. The findings and analysis presented will provide a valuable foundation for the development of English language learning approaches at MAN Insan Cendekia Jambi.

REFERENCES

- Amnie, A. G. (2018). An Investigation of Predictors of Self-efficacy to Cope with Stress and Implications for Health Education Practice. *American Journal of Health Education*, 49(3), 155–165. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19325037.2018.1431165>
- Asari, A. H. (2021). Penggunaan Model Cooperative Learning Tipe Two Stay Two Stray Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar IPS. *Journal of Social Knowledge Education (JSKE)*, 2(2), 26–30. <https://doi.org/10.37251/jske.v2i2.381>
- Aziezah, R. K. (2022). Penggunaan Media Gambar Seri sebagai Upaya Meningkatkan Kemampuan Menulis Karangan Cerita pada Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia. *PTK: Jurnal Tindakan Kelas*, 2(2), 94–100. <https://doi.org/10.53624/ptk.v2i2.56>
- Biyansyahna, E., & Maulana, R. (2020). Meningkatkan Kosakata Bahasa Inggris Siswa Dengan Menggunakan Gambar. *Journal Informatic, Education and Management*, 2(1), 55–72.
- Brødsgaard, A., Pedersen, J. T., Larsen, P., & Weis, J. (2019). Parents' and nurses' experiences of partnership in neonatal intensive care units: A qualitative review and meta-synthesis. In *Journal of Clinical Nursing* (Vol. 28, Issues 17–18). <https://doi.org/10.1111/jocn.14920>
- Chinta, R., Kebritchi, M., & Ellias, J. (2016). A conceptual framework for evaluating higher education institutions. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 30(6), 989–1002. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-09-2015-0120>
- Chugai, O. Y., Yamshynska, N. V., Svyrydova, L. H., & Kutsenok, N. M. (2021). The Peculiarities of Language Portfolio Implementation in the Teaching Process. *Transcarpathian Philological Studies*, 2(17), 71–75. <https://doi.org/10.32782/tps2663-4880/2021.17-2.14>
- Cintia, N. I., Kristin, F., & Anugraheni, I. (2018). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Discovery Learning Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Kreatif Dan Hasil Belajar Siswa. *Perspektif Ilmu Pendidikan*, 32(1), 67–75. <https://doi.org/10.21009/pip.321.8>
- Cruz, M. L., Saunders-Smiths, G. N., & Groen, P. (2020). Evaluation of competency methods in engineering education: a systematic review. *European Journal of Engineering Education*, 45(5), 729–757. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03043797.2019.1671810>
- Dachliyani, L. (2019). INSTRUMEN YANG SAHIIH : Sebagai Alat Ukur Keberhasilan Suatu Evaluasi Program Diklat (evaluasi pembelajaran). *MEDIKA: Media Informasi Dan Komunikasi Diklat Kepustakawanan*, 5(1), 57–65.
- Fauzi, A. (2020). The Application of Authentic Assessment As A Testing Technique In Seafaring Vocational Education and Training. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 8(3), 1–8.

- Ho, L., & Devi, I. P. (2020). Students ' Understanding of Interest in Learning Science. *Integrated Science Education Journal (ISEJ)*, 1(2), 60–64. <https://doi.org/10.37251/isej.v1i2.72>
- Kurniawan, M. S., Wijayanti, O., & Hawanti, S. (2020). Problematika Dan Strategi Dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Di Kelas Rendah Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Riset Pendidikan Dasar (JRPD)*, 1(1), 65–73. <https://doi.org/10.30595/.v1i1.7933>
- Magdalena, I., Ramdhan, S. N., Luftiyah, V., & Tangerang, U. M. (2021). ANALISIS PENILAIAN BERBASIS FORTOFOLIO PADA PEMBELAJARAN TEMATIK KELAS 3 DI SEKOLAH DASAR NEGERI BATUJAYA KECAMATAN BATU CEPER. *A R Z U S I N Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Dasar*, 1(1), 97–113.
- Marfuah, A., & Febriza, F. (2019). Penilaian Autentik pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) di Sekolah dan Perguruan Tinggi. *Fondatia*, 3(2), 35–58. <https://doi.org/10.36088/fondatia.v3i2.301>
- Mokkink, L. B., Boers, M., van der Vleuten, C. P. M., Bouter, L. M., Alonso, J., Patrick, D. L., de Vet, H. C. W., & Terwee, C. B. (2020). COSMIN Risk of Bias tool to assess the quality of studies on reliability or measurement error of outcome measurement instruments: a Delphi study. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 20(1), 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12874-020-01179-5>
- Muzari, T., Shava, G. N., & Shonhiwa, S. (2022). Qualitative Research Paradigm , a Key Research Design for Educational Researchers , Processes and Procedures : A Theoretical Overview. *OPEN ACCESS JOURNALS Indiana Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 03(01), 14–20.
- Nartiya, Ilmiah, P., Kedkaew, C., & David, A. (2022). Development of 3D Page Flip Physics E-Module with Sound Wave Material Based on Local Angklung Wisdom to Improve Integrated Science Process Skills. *Schrödinger: Journal of Physics Education*, 3(4), 99–109. <https://doi.org/10.37251/sjpe.v3i4.926>
- Ozan, C. (2019). The effect of authentic assessment on academic achievement and attitude towards educational measurement and opinions of prospective teachers. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 8(2), 299–312. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v8i2.18564>
- Padmawati, K. D., Arini, N. W., & Yudiana, K. (2019). Analisis Keterampilan Berbicara Siswa Kelas V Pada Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia. *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 2(2), 190–200. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v2i2.18626>
- Palm, T. (2008). Performance assessment and authentic assessment: A conceptual analysis of the literature. *Practical Assessment, Research and Evaluation*, 13(4), 1–11.
- Poerwanti, J. I. S., & Winarni, R. (2021). Pelatihan Dan Pendampingan Merancang Instrumen Assessment for Learning Berbasis Portofolio Pada Guru-Guru Sekolah. *Jurnal Widya Laksana*, 10(1), 44. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jwl.v10i1.28423>
- Razman, S. M., Ismail, Z., & Ismail, W. M. A. S. (2022). Developing a Teaching Module on Arabic Vocabulary Based on the Four Strands Theory for Pre-University Students in Malaysia: A Needs Analysis. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 12(11), 2263–2273. <https://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.1211.05>

- Sukenti, D., Tambak, S., & Siregar, E. (2021). Learning Assessment for Madrasah Teacher: Strengthening Islamic Psychosocial and Emotional Intelligence. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 13(1), 725–740.
- Syaravina, A. F., Juanda, A., & Yunita. (2019). Analisis Implementasi Penilaian Autentik Berdasarkan Kurikulum 2013 Pada Mata Pelajaran Biologi Kelas XI Semester Genap Di MA Al-Ishlah Bobos. *Jurnal Ilmu Alam Indonesia*, 2(2), 70–84.
- Wong, S.-C. (2020). Competency Definitions, Development and Assessment: A Brief Review. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 9(3), 95–114. <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarped/v9-i3/8223>