

## City marketing in various fields of scholar: The development of periodical concept and definition

Aisah Asnawi

Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business,  
Universitas Pattimura, Indonesia

*Correspondence author email: cheasnawi@yahoo.com*

DOI: 10.22437/ppd.v8i1.8743	Received: 13.02.2020	Revised: 09.04.2020	Accepted: 10.04.2020	Published: 30.04.2020
--------------------------------	-------------------------	------------------------	-------------------------	--------------------------

### Abstract

City marketing is a topic that attracts many researchers from various scholars. Some of them include management, urban planning, geography, communication science, and urban development. This is very interesting because the sliced theory of city marketing is very specific to each field of science. It is undeniable, the definition of city marketing is also growing from year to year. This research has an aim to mapping the concept and definition of city marketing from year to year to see the focus of discussion and the objectives of the city marketing strategy. The definition changes occur every year but the main focus of city marketing remains on the citizen, visitors, and investors. This is related to the function of a city as a place that is worth living, worth visiting and worth investing. Besides, the understanding that a city can be marketed like a product is highly inappropriate over time because the city has stakeholders and functions that are more complex than marketing in general. Based on the analysis of the chronology, the development of the city marketing concept has continued into several new concepts including city branding. The definition and concept also evolved since 1960 by Kevin Lynch but this paper divided into three periods, those are years 1982-1999, years 2000-2010, and years 2011-2018. During the period 1960 to 1980, the concept of city marketing was still influenced by Kevin Lynch so that not too many new concepts were developed.

**Keywords:** *City marketing, Evolution, Development, Concept*

**JEL Classification:** M31, M38, R58

### INTRODUCTION

For decades, cities around the world have applied the concepts and techniques of city marketing in their operations and strategies. (Kavaratzis, 2007). Almost all cities in the world initiate agendas and strategies to develop and secure their cities so that they can compete with other cities. (Boisen, 2007). The movement of people and capital is higher so that the city's marketing interest is increasing. This attracts competition between cities in attracting stronger visitors. (Lee, 2003; Hankinson, 2004; Anholt, 2005). City marketing was discussed by Kotler in 1993 not only in terminology but also in the form of concepts and actions based on traditional marketing concepts. (Kotler, Asplund, Rein, & Haider, 1999). Marketing theory for cities is developed and theoretically

conceptualized based on product marketing theory. A city is like a product. (Ashworth & Voogd, 1990).

During the period 1969 to 2018, the concept of city marketing evolved due to environmental changes that indicate globalization and economic growth. Currently there are 3,930,000,000 hits on Google (last checked 12 November 2019) about city marketing. It shows that city marketing is a very interesting topic and is implemented in each city in a different way.

This article is a development of the previous article titled *City Marketing: Chronological Definitions*, published at <http://ssrn.com/abstract=2832540>. The difference between this article and the previous article consists of several points, namely: 1) the difference in the periodical division of time; 2) this article discusses the concept of city marketing while the previous article only discusses the definition of city marketing; 3) This article also contains a mapping of various background researchers about the concept of city marketing from 1969 to 2018.

Some of these experts include experts in the field of management such as Kotler, Kavartzis, Rufaidah, and Ograjensek; Urban Planning experts such as Asworth & Voogd, Smyth, Braun, and Hospers; Geography experts such as Paddison and Boisen; Engineering & Design experts such as Yoon; and even communication experts such as Gelders & van Zullen. Differences in the field of science will lead to different concepts, but in terms of city marketing has similarities with "marketing place" and "city branding".

Although there are debates about the differences in these terms, but there are those who say these terms have a common understanding with city marketing. Further argues that city marketing, in fact, should be about city branding-because the goal of city marketing should be the management of a brand (Kavartzis, 2004). In reality, city marketing terminology is a Dutch invention, elsewhere, this phenomenon is called place marketing, location marketing, place selling and other designations.

This paper discusses more in-depth and more specific about the chronology of the definition of city marketing. This paper consists of four parts: introduction, methods, results and discussion, and the last conclusion and recommendation.

## **METHODS**

There are 5,430,000,000 searches about city marketing on Google and 3,110,000 on Google Scholar (Googling on January 2020). This shows that research on city marketing has developed rapidly, not only being a part of marketing science but also has penetrated into the fields of tourism, communication, urban planning, and other scholars.

In this study, various articles from researchers who wrote about city marketing were analyzed through descriptive mapping. The articles that are reviewed must be in accordance with the objectives of this study, which contain definitions and concepts. After that, it is divided and summarized in the time period that has been set to see the development of the definition of each researcher.

Determination of three time periods namely 1980-1999, 2000-2010, and 2011-2018 is based on the evolution of definitions and concepts that are neither too long nor too fast. It is understood that the definition and concept of city marketing will continue to develop along with the use and importance of this variable in the strategy of developing cities in the world.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### **City marketing from periodical concept**

City marketing is the one way to introduce a city or region. City marketing is not a new phenomenon in the world of marketing. Kevin Lynch has published a book entitled

"The Image of The City" in 1960. This is the beginning of the discussion the concept of city marketing. Since that, the terminology of city marketing develops over time and appears in various terms including place marketing (Kotler, Haider & Rein, 1993; Kotler, Asplund, Rein & Haider, 1999; Kozma, 2006; Van den Berg & Braun, 1999; Metaxas, 2009, Eriksson, 2010; Braun, Kavartzis, Zenker, 2013; Zenker & Petersen, 2010), city marketing (Deffner & Liouris, 2005; Braun, 2008; Kavartzis, 2009), rural marketing (Velayudhan, 2007), destination marketing (Baker & Cameron, 2008; Buhalis, 2000), territorial marketing (Dinis, 2004), urban marketing (Kavartzis & Aswoth, 2008), geographical marketing (Meester & Pellenbarg, 2001), village marketing (Kozma, 2006), and location marketing (Makombe & Kachwamba, 2011). (Kompaniets & Rauhut, 2016)

The term city marketing has become a discussion in various literature about cities in 1980 in Europe, but previously it began in America. (Van Den Berg, 1990). The problem has become widespread about the understanding of city marketing between practitioners and academics. Practitioners focus more on local economic development, promotion and cooperation between the public and private sectors and achieve regeneration. (Paddison, 1993). Whereas academics define city marketing as a long-term process that requires organized capacity to support different target groups. This is seen as a strategic, synthetic and integrated activity. (Hospers, 2010)

At the start of the new millennium, the focus of the place marketing debate shifted towards place branding (Kavartzis, 2008). In the last few years, place/city branding has been popular with the government, starting ranking among major cities in the world through the City Brand Index (Anholt, 2006). Even this term is more widely discussed including in politics and government but does not change the meaning of the true meaning. (Braun, 2008). In addition, the duality of understanding about city marketing also occurs between academics and practitioners. The main difference focuses on scientific and practical dimensions. An academic sees city marketing as a reaction of the city to compete with fellow cities, while practitioners see it as a box with specific managerial functions that can be applied. (Boisen, 2007)

Global cities have a high level of plurality and therefore clear definitions of vision, mission and identity are needed to be more attractive, consistent and competitive to increase market share in the global economy and strengthen economic development (Metaxas, 2009). In inter-regional competition, many marketing techniques are used and utilized for residents, companies and tourists and all of them aim to attract attention and build an image even to attract more educated residents. (Hospers, 2009; Zenker, 2010; Gertner, 2011). Major cities throughout the world adopt the concept of city marketing in the hope that they will have differentiation from other cities. In addition, competition between cities to attract investment is very strong (Hospers, 2010). The long-term goal of implementing city marketing in a city is long-term sustainability and creating satisfaction from the community or residents of the city (Ograjensek & Cirman, 2015).

### **City marketing: definition and concept**

1960

City should be made by art, shape for human purposes with multi-purpose, shifting organization, a tent for many function, raised by many hand and with relative speed. (Lynch, 1960)

1969

City marketing is carried out in order to create perception, maintain or change opinions, intentions and/or conduct of external people to the area (Levy, 1969)

1982

Burgess (1982) defines city marketing as a strategy to get a positive image through competition and all activities to produce and sell the city's space to developing and attract interesting of community.

1990

City Marketing refers on Van den Berg (1990) is selling the city: marketing approaches in public sector planning.

1993

city marketing rebuilds and redefines the city's image more than the promotion of place which reflects and bolsters the image through as specific targeting types of activities related to a socioeconomic function in the city Paddison (1993)

1994

City marketing allows quality policies in the development and completeness, availability, flexibility and creativity of new resources. This new resource can be in the form of capital, ideas, and local knowledge that is used as local policy. In this way, urban marketing is a strategic approach to collaboration between the public sector and private sectors. (Helbrecht, 1994) quoted by Kavartzis (2004). In the same year, Kriekaard (1994) defines city branding or city marketing as the whole of the city's strategy and activities coordinated by the city's authorities to initiate, promote, facilitate, foster, and execute transactions.

1999

Kotler, Asplund, Rein, & Haider (1999) introduced four key-elements in his own framework of city marketing. Those are design, infrastructure, basic services and attractions became the key categories. He transferred nearly all marketing terms to the scene of the city and argued that cities should define the products they wanted to sell before a specific strategy could be developed. That's the reason why Kotler also define city marketing as a method to attracting residents and companies using marketing insights. Van den Berg & Braun, (1999) define City marketing, in operational terms, refers to the conscious attempts to position a city, and increase the city's competitive advantage in relation to competing cities – with the explicit purpose of fulfilling specific ambitions of gaining shares of specific segments of the market through strategic initiatives.

2003

Kotler 2003, cited in Yoon (2010) suggests that city marketing concept by realizing specific locations as a product and through cooperation with various concerned parties. The cooperation in the form of facilitating the regional economy and raises the value of the city through the development of its environment, image, and various infrastructures for target such as the investors, residents, and visitors. Pechlaner, Zehrer, & Tancevski (2003) argue that city marketing in the broadest sense is a kind of marketing platform for downtown trading activities, thus concentrating on developing cities that focus specifically on retail trade, customer loyalty and downtown vitality through events . City marketing classically has a target group of customers, locals and tourists. Whereas city marketing in the narrow sense aims to synergize city marketing and tourism marketing. This integration leads to a deeper concentration of the city's marketing activities.

2004

Kavaratzis (2004) emphasizes that the object of marketing a city is the image of the city because the impression of the city occurs through perceptions and images. Therefore city marketing is highly dependent on construction, communication, and management of the city's image. Kavaratzis discussed more about city branding in the form of a theoretical framework categorized as primary communication, secondary communication, and tertiary communication. This concept was built based on a literature review on city marketing and corporate brands.

2005

Smyth (2005) defines city marketing as the promotion of a city to aim of drawing attention. This issue is to change the external perception of the city which sometimes not necessarily suitable, such as attracting new residents, motivating the relocation of businesses; and encouraging the development of tourism. This opinion was also quoted by Ograjensek & Cirman (2015). Further, it is stated that some organic cities, (cities with a history of hundreds of years) like Jerusalem, Rome or Berlin do not require an integrated strategy to market towns like this because it has been formed and established culturally (Ograjensek & Cirman, 2015)

2007

Boisen in his article (2007) quoting from Arcarani & Valadi, (2000) explain that city marketing has four goals: 1) the improvement of the urban products, covers the city and everything it contains; 2) the growth of the incentives for consumers to make use of the city's products; 3) the improvement of infrastructure and institutions that provide or improve access to the city's product and; 4) the communication of the city that making potential targets aware of the products the city has to offer.

City marketing also initiatives to increase or defend their competitive position as attractive places for business, citizens, events and visitors (Boisen, 2007).

Gyeonggi Research Institute (2007) defines city marketing as a commercial marketing activity in the form of selling and exchanges city spaces for gaining capital and seeks to attract targets. In other words, city marketing is a strategy to deal with targets (residents, enterprises, and visitors) and attract them through promotion combined with values and a city environment.

The American Marketing Association (AMA), defines marketing' to be: "...an organizational function and a set of processes for creating, communicating and delivering value to customers and for managing customer relationships in ways that benefit the organization and its stakeholders." (AMA, 2007).

Rufaidah (2007), defines city marketing through an understanding of marketing according to the AMA which is then interpreted in city marketing as the process of creating, communicating, and giving values to the stakeholders of the city or region to achieve sustainable economic development, social sustainability, and environmental sustainability.

2008

Braun (2008) states that city marketing is the use of marketing tools that are coordinated with a customer-oriented philosophy, to create, communicate, deliver and exchange offers that are valuable to visitors and the city community in general. This definition was adopted and developed from AMA (2007) which defines city marketing as city marketing

is a long-term process and / or policy instrument including all different, related activities aimed at attracting and maintaining specific target groups for a particular city.

2010

Yoon (2010) states that city marketing is a city strategy to offer something better than other cities in competition, and all activities that are produced in order to sell city space through a positive image of the city so that it can become an attractive city compared to other cities.

Hospers (2010) Most experienced marketers regard the city as a product, meaning that a city can be marketed as a product (Ward, 1998; Kotler, Asplund, Rein, & Haider, 1999; Rainisto, 2003; Braun, 2008). A result is a form of commodification, that is a marketing campaign by using logos, slogans, advertisements, brochures, exhibitions, displays, websites, events and various attractions.

2011

Hospers (2011) defines city marketing as an interaction that exists in the management of city policy areas, such as education, employment, or housing associated with three target groups, namely tourists, citizens, and companies.

2012

Balencourt & Zafra (2012) making city marketing concept as the promotion of a city that aims to encourage certain activities to change the external perception of a city. That perception to encourage tourism, attract new residents, or allow business/investment relocation. An important feature of city marketing is the development of new areas, or buildings and infrastructure.

2013

In a study of city marketing issued by the City of Melbourne (2013). city marketing is understood as promoting the power of cities that shape the character of the city, such as nature, heritage, specially made, or man-made. It is also about managing a place or destination and providing access to services and facilities that facilitate tourist visits.

2015

Short (2015) At present, although naming remains important, the application of city marketing standards includes the development of media and the creation of slogans or taglines and logos or series of images that contain the features of a city. even today, there are companies that specialize in branding and city branding.

2016

Kompaniets & Rauhut, (2016) said city marketing aims to promote and support competitive advantages that have the characteristics of a city in a strategic way so as to improve the image of the city better than before.

2018

Zenker (2018) In general, the city marketing definition refers to the opinion of Braun (2008) which can be understood as the use of tools in marketing in a coordinated and customer-oriented manner. This refers to the application of marketing instruments to promote and develop through routine communication such as advertising, social media, designing policies to improve public management to accommodate the needs and desires of various target groups (tourists, residents and investors). (“Editorial : City marketing and branding as urban policy,” 2018)

**Table 1.** City marketing mapping

<b>Year</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Concept</b>
<b>Initial Concept</b>		
1969	Levy	Create perception, maintain or change opinions, intentions and/or conduct of external people to the area.
<b>1<sup>st</sup> Periode (1980-1999)</b>		
1982	Burges	Strategy of cities to develop attractiveness
1990	Van den Berg	Marketing in public sector
1993	Paddison	socioeconomic function to rebuild and redefine their image
1994	Helbrecht	strategic approach to collaboration between the public sector and private sectors
1999	Kriekaard, T	city's strategy that coordinated by the city's authorities
	Kotler,	Method to attracting residents and companies using marketing insights.
	Van den Berg & Braun	Gaining shares of specific segments of the market through strategic initiatives
<b>2<sup>nd</sup> Period (2000-2010)</b>		
2003	Kotler	Raises the value of the city for the investors, residents and visitors
2004	Pechlaner, Zehrer, & Tancevski, nd	Synergize city marketing and tourism marketing to the target group of customers, locals and tourists.
	Kavaratzis	Construction, communication, and management of the city's image
2005	Smyth	Promotion of a city for business, immigrant and tourist.
2007	Gyeonggi	Competitive position as attractive places for business, citizens, events and visitors.
2008	Rufaidah	Process of creating, communicating, and giving values to the stakeholders
	Braun	Marketing tools that are valuable to visitors and the city community in general
2010	Yoon	City's strategy to offer something better than other cities through a positive image of the city.
<b>3<sup>rd</sup> Period (2011-2018)</b>		
2011	Hospers	City policy to interaction with three target groups tourist, citizens, and companies
2012	Balencourt	Promotion of a city to encourage certain activities such as tourism, attract new residents, or allow business / investment relocation.
2013	City Government of Melbourne	Promoting the power of cities that shape the character of the city, managing a place or destination that facilitate tourist visits.
2015	Short	Creation of slogans or taglines and logos or series of images that contain the features of a city.
2016	Kompaniets & Rauhut	Strategy to improve the image of the city better than before.
2018	Zenker	Refers to the opinion of Braun (2008)

The development of concepts and definitions of city marketing is very diverse, adjusted to the development of each field of science. As should be clear by now, city marketing borrows a lot of its concepts and terminology from traditional marketing. Some scholars use the terminology place marketing (Avraham & Ketter, 2008) or place branding (Kavaratzis). However, in this article these differences will be ruled out and only use the terminology of city marketing

The chronology and the development of the concept of city marketing has evolved even since 1969. This paper will be divided into three periods; first period start from 1980 to 1999 referring to the article of Burges, Van Den Berg & Braun, 1999; Paddison (1993), Kotler, Haider & Rein (1993); Kotler, Asplund, Rein & Haider (1999), Helbrecht (1994), and Kriekaard (1999) . During this first period, the time span of the concept and definition of city marketing has been developed but not too fast, it was the emphasis on strategies or methods to strengthen the perception and opinion of external people towards a city. This was applied in the form of strengthening the image in order to attract residents and companies or the private sector. In the first period, the concept of destination image was not overly developed and complex as effective marketing tools in promoting cities.

From 2000 to 2010, the discussion of the definition of city marketing was limited in academic fields such as economics, geography, and planning. (Asnawi, Kartini, Afiff, Rufaidah, 2018). This discussion contributes to the applying of the traditional concept in city marketing which refers to problems and solutions as well as an application of marketing in a city. Therefore, experts have used more conventional marketing methods or strategies for attracting tourists and selling the potential of the city. This is done through increased promotion in order to improve the image of the city that aims to the improvement of the social economy.

While the second period from 2000-2010 referring to Kotler (2003) in Yoon (2010), Pechlaner, Zehrer & Tancevski (2003), Kavaratzis (2007), Smyth (2005), Gyeonggi Research Institute (2007), Rufaidah (2007), Braun (2008) and Yoon (2010). The concept at this time is more directed to the communication process that strengthens the image of the city in order to attract residents, visitors and investors. The marketing concept used in this period is getting stronger with the emergence of a stronger city branding in shaping the image of the city.

Third period, since 2011 until 2018 there has been a development of the definition of city marketing conducted by experts such as Hospers (2011), Balencourt & Zafra (2012), City Government of Melbourne (2013), Short (2015), Kompaniets & Rauhut (2016), and Zenker (2018). Whereas in third period, 2011-2018 the concept of city marketing is containing functions in marketing management, clearer and more measurable, considering the interests of all stakeholders (residents, investors, and visitors) especially tourists. The definition discusses about slogan and tagline which can strengthening the image of a city. The competition between cities very competitive It also highlights the uniqueness of a city and the positive things that can increase the value of the city.

In addition to the division according to a time period, city marketing is also divided according to the school thought of city marketing experts. Some experts regard a city as a product (Kotler (2003) in Yoon (2010), Kavaratzis (2009), Gyeonggi Research Institute (2007), and Braun (2008)). However, despite having this idea, the researchers still believe that marketing a city is different from marketing a product. Meanwhile, according to some experts such (Rufaidah (2007), Boisen (2007), and Lombarts (2008)) city marketing is a process of targeted and measurable activities to achieve long-term or sustainable goal.



## CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

### Conclusions

Since *Undang-Undang No. 12 Tahun 2004* ((Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 12 of 2004) was issued on regional autonomy, each city and province was given the authority to manage their regions in several sectors, including the tourism sector. City marketing and tourism sector are closely related so that the concept of city marketing will continue to develop from year to year to make a city more competitive. A city, competing with other cities in all aspects, that is why a city needs the right strategy in marketing the city.

At present, the development of a city cannot be separated from the marketing strategies commonly used by business companies. If a company uses a marketing strategy to achieve profit, then a city uses a marketing strategy to maintain and comfort the population, attract visitors and attract investors to help increase the competitiveness of the city more than other cities.

In addition, it is not only the field of marketing that deals with city marketing but also other fields of science that also have an interest in the development of a city. Therefore, the concept of urban marketing will be more diverse and broad because it is seen from various perspectives in the field of science.

### Recommendations

Discussions about city marketing will continue to grow every year. This research only focuses on mapping concepts and definitions. There are still many other things that can be explored in this variable. For example the evolution and city marketing strategies of each city. This is interesting because some cities are very successful in implementing city marketing to attract millions of tourists, but some are failed in city marketing policies. Therefore, subsequent research on city marketing further enriches the concept and understanding of these variables in various fields of science.

## REFERENCES

- Anholt, S. (2005). Some important distinctions in place branding. *Place Branding*, 1(2), 116–21.
- Anholt, S. (2006), *Competitive Identity: The New Brand Management For Nations, Cities And Regions*. London: Palgrave, MacMillan
- AMA. (2007). *American Marketing Association - New Definition of Marketing*. Retrieved from: <http://www.marketingpower.com>
- Arcarani, F., & Valadi, E. (2000). *Marketing places. A Resource-Based Approach And Empirical Evidence From The European Experience*. Retrieved from: <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.484.4743&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Ashworth, G. J. & Voogd, H. (1990). *Selling The City: Marketing Approaches In Public Sector Urban Planning*. London: Belhaven Press
- Asnawi, A., Kartini, D., Afiff, F., & Rufaidah. (2018). City marketing: Scale development and measurement indicators applicated to Maluku Province- Indonesia. *Cogent Business & Management*, 5(1). DOI: [10.1080/23311975.2018.1525827](https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2018.1525827)
- Avraham, E., & Ketter, E. (2008). *Media Strategies For Marketing Places In Crisis*. Oxford: Elsevier Inc.
- Baker, M.J. & Cameron, E. (2008). Critical Success Factors In Destination Marketing. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 8(2), 79–97

- Balencourt, A. & Zafra, A.C. (2012). *City Marketing: How To Promote a City? The case of Umea*. Master's thesis. Umeå School of Business, Umeå, Sweden. Retrieved from <http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:560181/FULLTEXT01>
- Braun, E. (2008). *City Marketing: Towards an Integrated Approach*. Rotterdam, Netherland: Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam
- Braun, E., Kavaratzis, M., & Zenker, S. (2013). My City–My Brand: The Different Roles Of Residents In Place Branding. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 6 (1), 18–28
- Burges, J.A. (1982). Selling Places: Environmental Images For The Executive. *Regional Studies*, 16(1), 11-17
- Boisen, M. (2007). *The Strategic Application Of City Marketing To Middle-Sized Cities*. (Unpublished Master's thesis) Faculty of Geosciences, Utrecht University, Netherlands
- Buhalis, D. (2000). Marketing the Competitive Destination of the Future. *Tourism Management*, (21)1, 97–116
- City of Melbourne. (2013). Melbourne City Marketing Strategy 2013-16. Melbourne Not An Ordinary City. Retrieved from: <https://www.melbourne.vic.gov.au/SiteCollectionDocuments/melbourne-city-marketing-strategy.pdf>
- Deffner, A., & Liouris, C. (2005). *City Marketing: A Significant Planning Tool For Urban Development In A Globalised Economy*. Paper presented at the 45<sup>th</sup> Congress Of The European Regional Science Association, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. Retrieved from <https://econpapers.repec.org/RePEc:wiw:wiwrsa:ersa05p395>
- Dinis, A. (2004). *Territorial Marketing: A Useful Tool for Competitiveness of Rural and Peripheral Areas*. A Paper presented at the 44th European Congress of ERSA in Porto, Portugal. Retrieved from <https://ideas.repec.org/p/wiw/wiwrsa/ersa04p681.html>
- Eriksson, M. (2010). *Reproducing a periphery: popular representations of the Swedish North*. Doctoral thesis, Kulturgeografiska institutionen, Umeå universitet. Retrieved from <http://umu.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A354324&dswid=3334>
- Gelders, D & van Zullen, B. (2013). City Events: Short and Serial Reproduction Effects On The City's Image. *Corporate Communications: An international Journal*, 18(1), 110 – 188
- Gertner, D. (2011). A tentative meta-analysis of the “place marketing” and “place branding” literature. *Journal of Brand Management*, 19, 112–131. DOI: [doi.org/10.1057/bm.2011.13](https://doi.org/10.1057/bm.2011.13),
- Gyeonggi Research Institute. (2007). *A Study On The Methodology Of Developing City Brand Identity: Cases of Cities in Gyeonggi Province*. Retrieved from <http://www.dbpia.co.kr/journal/articleDetail?nodeId=NODE01438367>
- Hankinson, G. (2004). Relational Network Brands: Towards a Conceptual Model of Place Brands. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 10(2), 109–21.
- Hospers, G.J (2010), Making sense of place: from cold to warm city marketing, *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 3(3), 182-193
- Hospers, G.J (2011). Er gaat niets boven citymarketing., hoe zet je een plaats op de kaart? *Zaltbommel, Nederland: Haystack*.
- Kavaratzis, M. (2004). From City Marketing to City Branding: Towards a Theoretical Framework for Developing City Brands. *Place Brand Public Dipl*, 1, 58 - 73

- Kavaratzis, M. (2007). City Marketing: The Past, the Present and Some Unresolved Issues. *Geography Compass*, 1(3), 695 – 712
- Kavaratzis, M. & Ashworth, G.J. (2008) Place Marketing: How Did We Get Here And Where Are We Going?. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 1(2), 150 – 165
- Kavaratzis, M. (2009). What Can We Learn From City Marketing. *European spatial research and policy*, 16(1), 41 - 58
- Kompaniets. O.R. & Rauhut, D. (2016). *Place Marketing of Rural Areas: Why Cannot City Marketing Strategies be 'Copy-Pasted'?*. Paper presented at the Regional Studies Association's European Conference, Graz, Australia. Retrieved from [https://www.regionalstudies.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Rauhut-Place\\_Marketing\\_of\\_Rural\\_Areas.pdf](https://www.regionalstudies.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Rauhut-Place_Marketing_of_Rural_Areas.pdf)
- Kotler, P., Haider, D.H., & Rein, I. (1993). *Marketing Place: Marketing Places: Attracting Investments, Industries, and Tourism to Cities, States and Nations*. New York: Macmillan Inc
- Kotler, P., Asplund, C., Rein, I & Haider, D. (1999). *Marketing Places Europe: Attracting Investments, Industries, Residents and Visitors to European Cities, Communities, Regions and Nations in Europe*. London: Financial Time
- Kozma, G. (2006). *Place Marketing*. (Doctoral dissertation). University of Debrecen, Hungary Krugman
- Kriekaard, J.A. (1994), *Het Domein Van City Marketing: Een Bijdrage Aan Theorieontwikkeling* Rotterdam: RIBES
- Levy, S.J. (1969). Broadening the Concept of marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 33(1), 10-15.
- Lynch, K. (1960). *The Image Of The City.*, London: The M.I.T Press
- Lombarts, A. (2008). *De Hunkerende Stad: Bewoners, Bedrijven en Bezoekers en hun Onderlinge Interactie en Spanningsvelden*. Hogeschool Inholland: Amsterdam
- Makombe, I., & Kachwamba, M. (2011). Internet Marketing in The Public Sector: The Case of Investment Promotion Agencies. *International Journal of eBusiness and eGovernment studies* 3(2):79-89.
- Meester, W.J. & Pellenbarg, P.H. (2001). *Changing regional images. Are regional marketing campaigns successful?* A paper presented at the 41st European Congress of the Regional Science Association in Zagreb, Croatia
- Metaxas, T. (2009). Place Marketing , Strategic Planning and Competitiveness : The Case of Malta Place Marketing , Strategic Planning and Competitiveness : The Case of Malta. *European Planning Studies*, 17(9), 37–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09654310903053539>
- Ograjensek, P, & Cirman, A. (2015). Internal City Marketing: Positive Activation of Inhabitants Through Supported Voluntarism. *Ekonomeski Vjesnik/Econviews*, 28, 139-152
- Paddison, R. (1993). City Marketing, Image Reconstruction and Urban Regeneration. *Urban Studies*, 30(2), 339-349
- Pechlaner, H, Zehrer, A & Tancevski, A. (2003). *Destination Marketing and City Management in urban areas – Towards solving potential conflict fields*. Retrieved from [https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/beb5/de076b9329ae082ff81fb8cadf013b5cb5f0.pdf?\\_ga=2.68124244.495464218.1587303575-561197618.1562349134](https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/beb5/de076b9329ae082ff81fb8cadf013b5cb5f0.pdf?_ga=2.68124244.495464218.1587303575-561197618.1562349134)

- Rainisto, S. (2003). *Success Factors of Place Marketing: A Study of Place Marketing Practices in Northern Europe and the United States*. (Doctoral dissertation). University of Technology, Helsinki
- Rufaidah, P. (2007). City Marketing Model for Bandung City. *Harian Pikiran Rakyat*.
- Rufaidah, P. (2014). *City Marketing Model for Bandung City*. Paper presented at the International Conferences of Asian Marketing Associations (ICAMA). Sogang University, Seoul, Korea
- Short, J.R. (2015). City Marketing. *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Sciences, 2nd edition*, 662-668. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.74006-2>
- Smyth, H. (2005). *Marketing the City. The Role of Flagship Developments in Urban Regeneration*. London: E. & F.N. Spon
- Van den Berg, L. (1990). *Strategische City-Marketing*. Schoonhoven: Academic Service, Economie en Bedrijfskunde.
- Van den Berg, L., & Braun, E. (1999). Urban Competitiveness, Marketing and the Need for Organising Capacity. *Urban Studies*, 36(5,6), 987-999.
- Velayudhan, S.K. (2007). *Rural Marketing: Targeting the Non-urban Consumer*. New Delhi: Response books
- Ward, S. (1998). *Selling Places. The Marketing and Selling Promotion Places of Towns and Cities 1850-2000*. London: E. & F.N. Spon
- Yoon, J. (2010). *A Conceptual Model for City Branding Based on Semiotics*. (Doctoral dissertation). Department of Engineering and Design, Brunel University, London
- Zenker, S. & Petersen, S. (2010). *Resident-City Identification: Translating the Customer Relationship Management Approach into Place Marketing Theory*. 50th European Regional Science Association Congress, Jönköping, Sweden, 19th – 23rd August, 2010
- Zenker, S. (2018.) Editorial: City Marketing and Branding as Urban Policy. *Cities*, 80, 1-3. DOI: 10.1016/j.cities.2018.06.001



© 2020 by the authors. Licensee JPPD, Indonesia. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).