

Women's entrepreneurial competence within a patriarchal social system

Hilmiana*; Devi Alviani

Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

**To whom correspondence should be addressed: hilmiana@unpad.ac.id*

| | | | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| DOI: 10.22437/ppd.v11i3.29127 | Received: 05.07.2023 | Revised: 19.08.2023 | Accepted: 23.08.2023 | Published: 30.08.2023 |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|

Abstract

Women in patriarchal social systems face various challenges that affect their economic access and hinder their empowerment. This research aims to identify the competencies required by women to thrive within a patriarchal social system, reduce gender disparities, and promote empowerment in various aspects of life. This research utilized secondary data from the Scopus database and applied a document study method. Keywords used for the search included "women competence," "women skills," "women entrepreneur skills," "entrepreneurial competencies," and "entrepreneur competence." After filtering, 31 articles were selected for analysis. The analysis used the Miles and Huberman model, including reduction, data analysis, and conclusion. The findings indicate that to address the challenges of patriarchy and achieve empowerment, women need to develop multidimensional competencies involving entrepreneurial skills, commitment, high-level conceptual abilities, recognition of opportunities, organization, relationships, strategic thinking, and marketing. The challenges of norms and gender expectations in patriarchal societies become obstacles that need to be overcome by educating the community about the vital role of women and the competencies required in SMEs (Small and Medium Enterprises). Innovation, creativity, and innovative marketing strategies are key to success, while support and networks from stakeholders can provide valuable boosts.

Keywords: *Entrepreneurial competence, Gender equality, Patriarchy, Women's competence, Women's skills*

JEL Classification: J16, L26, O35

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia's micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) drive economic growth, create employment opportunities, and contribute significantly to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Data indicates that around 64.5% of the 64 million MSMEs in Indonesia are managed by women, highlighting women's dominance in this sector (Aditya, 2023). However, the success of MSMEs does not always reflect the overall economic security of Indonesia. MSMEs often struggle to compete due to difficulties in

empowering resources. In response, achieving competitive advantage requires adequate knowledge and skills for entrepreneurs (Timotius, 2023).

Entrepreneurial knowledge and skills are considered competencies (Spencer & Spencer, 1993), enabling business operators to produce optimal work output with high quality (Fazal et al., 2022). These competencies also enhance competitive advantage (Lee et al., 2022) and the long-term sustainability of businesses (Annelin & Boström, 2022). However, the MSME sector in Indonesia faces several competency issues, such as a lack of production skills, management knowledge, business legality, low entrepreneurial spirit, and insufficient assistance and optimization of equipment by MSME players (Susantiningrum, 2018). Other challenges involve the inability of products to compete, limited marketing, limited human resources, insufficient capital, constraints in utilizing technology and information, suboptimal financial management, and a lack of awareness to register patents such as trademarks, logos, and formulas (Da Costa et al., 2022; Martini, 2018; Yunita & Retnandasari, 2022). Differences in social systems further complicate all of these.

The social system in Indonesia reflects gender power distribution, with the Batak tribe adopting a patriarchal system while the Minangkabau tribe adheres to matriarchy (Smith, 2014). However, issues often arise in the patriarchal system that weakens performance and maintains male superiority, permanently placing women in inferior positions (Adisa et al., 2021; Sadrnabavi & Daneshvar, 2023). The impact is directly felt in women's entrepreneurial competencies, which may face constraints in expressing creativity accessing economic resources, education, support, networks, and business autonomy. Discrimination in business can also hinder women's career development and entrepreneurial efforts, creating significant challenges in achieving optimal competencies. This situation has serious implications, especially for women entrepreneurs with fewer opportunities to secure external funding than men-led businesses (Guzman & Kacperczyk, 2019). Exclusion from economic opportunities and barriers to women's empowerment, including limited access to certain sectors, hinder the success of women entrepreneurs (Cinar & Kose, 2018; Setyaningrum et al., 2023). Therefore, emphasis on developing women's competencies in entrepreneurship becomes an urgent need.

Competency development requires literature studies to enhance skills, knowledge, and entrepreneurial elements to make businesses more successful (Johari et al., 2023). Although existing literature observes that vocational training and workshops can somewhat improve entrepreneurial competencies (Movono & Dahles, 2017; Tran & Walter, 2014), it overlooks that running a business requires high standards and complex competencies. Moreover, some academic entrepreneurship literature has been criticized for its gender-neutral and "taken-for-granted norms" application (Tedmanson et al., 2012), not considering gender dimensions and their impact on performance, as well as entrepreneurial growth (Ahl & Marlow, 2012). Therefore, studies related to women's entrepreneurship deserve attention (ChoudhuryKaul et al., 2023; Marlow et al., 2009), considering the lack of efforts to improve women's entrepreneurial competencies in developing countries, the weak understanding of the performance of women entrepreneurs' businesses, and the increasing participation of women. This research aims to answer the critical question, "What competencies are needed by women entrepreneurs to support the sustainability of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises

(MSMEs) in the patriarchal social system?". The answer to this research question will expand and deepen women entrepreneurs' competencies in the social system. This research also contributes significantly to understanding and enhancing women entrepreneurs' competencies, which, in turn, can support economic growth, gender equality, and the development of MSMEs in Indonesia. This research can serve as a foundation for further discussion and actions supporting the role of women in the business world.

METHODS

This research aims to identify the competencies women entrepreneurs require to support the sustainability of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in the patriarchal social system. The research method employed is qualitative, using a descriptive approach with data collection through a literature review. A comprehensive literature review was conducted to obtain secondary data from Scopus-indexed journals. The Scopus database was chosen for its accurate and credible journals with a rigorous review process.

Although data collection was done through a literature review using the Scopus database, it is important to note that diversification of literature sources, cultural inclusivity, and sensitivity to cultural and gender contexts were crucial factors considered. The holistic literature review also integrated literature from various sources, such as practical reports and experiences of women entrepreneurs. Efforts to address potential biases and gaps involved careful article selection following the steps of the Miles and Huberman model, which includes data reduction (summarizing and classifying data with exclusion criteria), data analysis (describing the data structure and relationships), and critical review for concluding.

The data collection process was carried out using keywords such as "women competence," "women skills," "women entrepreneur skills," "entrepreneurial competencies," and "entrepreneur competence" on the Scopus database, resulting in 834 documents. Data reduction was then performed three times. Firstly, filtering the most recent publications with a limited period from 2019 to 2023 in business management, document type as a journal, and source type as a journal written in English resulted in 182 documents. Secondly, exclusion criteria review was conducted by applying several criteria (1) following the general process for observing research trends in a field during an SLR (Battisti et al., 2023; Radaelli & Sitton-Kent, 2016), we removed duplicate articles and papers that were partially written in English (e.g., abstract in English, text in another language) (Sousa et al., 2008). (2) we evaluated the titles, abstracts, and keywords of the papers, disregarding studies that did not align with the main purpose of our review (Christofi et al., 2017). In this step, we were flexible and inclusive, as no in-depth consideration was made to determine whether the study focused partly or entirely on our research question (Vrontis & Christofi, 2021), postponing this evaluation to the next stage. Therefore, the sample of articles also met the exclusion criteria was 64. Thirdly, out of the 64 articles, we performed a calibration process to select papers (Aguinis et al., 2018) and only included papers that enriched the understanding of the competencies of women entrepreneurs in the patriarchal system. However, we also included papers whose main focus was not on patriarchal countries but still shed light on the analyzed research area. For this reason, we excluded 33 papers, and our sample became 31 documents for analysis.

The analysis was conducted by reviewing the findings from all included publications to extract, synthesize, and identify the competencies women entrepreneurs require to support the sustainability of MSMEs in the patriarchal social system.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This research addresses critical questions regarding the key competencies needed to support the sustainability of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) run by women entrepreneurs, especially in the context of the patriarchal social system in Indonesia. In managing MSMEs, women must possess entrepreneurial skills, which can be acquired through various means, including openness, willingness to accept guidance, and leveraging operational support (Kim, 2023). These skills are reinforced by entrepreneurship education, understanding entrepreneurial competencies, and experience, as indicated by (Agarwal et al., 2023; Esubalew & Raghurama, 2020; Fazal et al., 2022; Laras et al., 2023; Taipale Erävala et al., 2019; Timotius, 2023):

Commitment

Women in Indonesia's patriarchal social system face traditional norms and expectations related to gender roles, which may perceive entrepreneurial activities as inconsistent with traditional female roles. However, to support the sustainability of micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs), women must develop commitment competencies that demand high initiative and dedication to the business's vision and mission. Thus, they must demonstrate resilience and enthusiasm, especially when facing obstacles and challenges.

Women must realize that entrepreneurial activities can start from the smallest and earliest opportunities. They can utilize natural resources as raw materials to create valuable products with minimal capital. For example, processing fish catches into ready-to-eat meals or transforming cocoa and sago into snacks. These products can attract market interest locally and internationally with patience, creativity, and innovation.

High-level conceptual abilities

In a social system that sometimes limits access to information, women entrepreneurs need to sharpen their analytical qualities. The ability to handle complex issues, evaluate risks, and comprehend intricate information is crucial in facing business opportunities amid the dynamics of the patriarchal system. Women in this social system can attend business analysis, management, and entrepreneurship courses, training, or workshops. They can engage in discussions and confront challenges, seeking support from successful entrepreneurs, academics, or other women business leaders who can provide valuable insights, advice, and perspectives.

Opportunity recognition

Cultural norms hindering women from actively seeking business opportunities are obstacles that must be overcome. In facing these barriers, competency in recognizing opportunities is crucial for women entrepreneurs. They need to have a high initiative to identify and explore new opportunities despite cultural norms that tend to restrict women's active roles in the business world.

Women entrepreneurs can take concrete steps to realize their visions by harnessing creativity and innovation. The speed of taking innovative steps is crucial in

supporting the sustainability of women's Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs). Thus, this ability motivates overcoming cultural barriers and creates innovative opportunities to impact women's MSMEs positively.

Organizational competence

Managing, delegating, and training skills become crucial in facing organizational challenges. Women must efficiently manage resources and design strategies to identify strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats, including promotional and marketing strategies. Efficient production skills in terms of cost and time are also essential. Effective communication management to coordinate with suppliers, distributors, and consumers, as well as financial administration, time discipline, and friendly customer service, creates added value and maintains a unique position in the market.

Relationship competence

Despite patriarchal norms creating obstacles in building strong relationships with stakeholders such as investors, customers, and team members, relationship competency allows women to communicate effectively, persuade stakeholders, and build mutually beneficial collaborations. This helps them overcome cultural norms and build support around their businesses.

Strategic competence

Strategic competence is key for women entrepreneurs facing uncertainty and risks in managing businesses amid patriarchal norms. They design and plan sustainable strategies and dare to take risks, implement innovation, and manage projects.

Women entrepreneurs need the ability to work independently, make crucial decisions, and maintain independence and high self-confidence in facing business challenges and opportunities. They must practice a growth mindset, be open to innovation, proactive in development, brave in taking risks, be inspirational, responsible, and have intellectual intelligence. Thus, strategic competence helps manage uncertainty and risk and shapes the attitudes and abilities needed to maintain the sustainability of women's MSMEs in the patriarchal system.

Marketing competence

Marketing competence is a key element. Distinguishing products from competitors, building effective relationships between industry and customers, and encouraging marketing innovations are crucial factors emphasized in the literature (Olazo, 2023). Marketing innovations open new opportunities for economic growth and positively impact how society works, lives, and interacts. Thus, women entrepreneurs must develop competencies that enable them to connect globally and use technology to enhance their businesses (Kruger & Steyn, 2021).

In its practical application, women in the patriarchal social system can use product variations to achieve business sustainability. Innovations in processing sago into various products, such as pasta, sago macaroni, flavored sago chips, cakes, beverages, and jelly, can create diversification, allowing penetration into a broader market. The use of social media is also crucial in shaping the image of attractive products. Learning processes involving taking product photos, writing engaging reviews, and advertising products at the right time can enhance marketing effectiveness (Sujarwo et al., 2022). Moreover, word-of-mouth promotions, delivering products to culinary stores, and collaborating with distributors and educational institutions are conventional strategies that remain

relevant.

When women entrepreneurs implement these strategies, their talents can be recognized, and the delegation of roles and responsibilities in managing businesses will increase, contributing positively to women's perceptions of gender in the entrepreneurial world (Cosentino & Paoloni, 2021). Thus, improving these skills can be a strategic step in achieving the sustainability of women's MSMEs in the patriarchal social system.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

This research investigates key competencies that support the sustainability of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) run by women entrepreneurs in the context of the patriarchal social system in Indonesia. The research findings indicate that women entrepreneurs must develop multidimensional competencies involving entrepreneurial skills, commitment, high-level conceptual abilities, opportunity recognition, organizational competence, relationship competence, strategic competence, and marketing competence. Challenges posed by gender norms and expectations in a patriarchal society need to be overcome by educating the community about the vital role of women and the competencies required in MSMEs. Innovation, creativity, and innovative marketing strategies are key to success, while support and networks from stakeholders can provide valuable encouragement. By developing relevant skills and competencies, women can overcome gender stereotypes and create entrepreneurial opportunities, ultimately enhancing their roles and contributions to economic development and the sustainability of local communities.

Recommendations

The importance of empowering women in the entrepreneurial world in Indonesia can be enhanced through strategic steps. Firstly, the government and relevant institutions should focus on strengthening entrepreneurial education for women by improving their access to quality programs. This can be achieved by implementing inclusive training programs, courses, and workshops that significantly enhance the skills and understanding of women entrepreneurs. Additionally, there is a need for advocacy campaigns and increased public awareness. By changing norms and expectations related to gender roles through strong campaigns, an environment that supports the active participation of women in the entrepreneurial world can be created. Finally, developing specialized support programs for women entrepreneurs by the government and non-governmental organizations can be a concrete step. These programs may include mentorship, training, and access to financial resources to assist women entrepreneurs in managing and developing their businesses sustainably.

Further studies are needed to understand the impact of implementing this research's identified competencies and strategies. This research can contribute to understanding how women entrepreneurs can successfully face challenges in the patriarchal social system. Moreover, to delve deeper into aspects, future research can focus the analysis on the local context, considering cultural and social factors influencing the development of women's entrepreneurial competencies.

Case studies and analyses of best practices from successful women entrepreneurs can provide concrete insights into applying competencies in real life. Evaluating the effectiveness of specialized education and training programs for women and their positive impacts should also be a focus of further research. Additionally, research can further explore the role of technology and innovation in assisting women entrepreneurs and measure the impact of government policies in promoting gender equality in the economy.

REFERENCES

- Adisa, T. A., Aiyenitaju, O., & Adekoya, O. D. (2021). The work–family balance of British working women during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Journal of Work-Applied Management*, *13*(2), 241–260. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JWAM-07-2020-0036>
- Aditya, I. (2023). *UMKM Perempuan Indonesia Mencapai 37 Juta Orang*. Available at: <https://www.krjogja.com/nasional/1242464028/umkm-perempuan-indonesia-mencapai-37-juta-orang>
- Agarwal, S., Agrawal, V., Ramadani, V., Dixit, J. K., & Gërguri-Rashiti, S. (2023). An empirical investigation and assessment of entrepreneurial learning factors: a DEMATEL approach. *Journal of Research in Marketing and Entrepreneurship*, *25*(1), 127–149. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JRME-05-2021-0059>
- Aguinis, H., Ramani, R. S., & Alabduljader, N. (2018). What You See Is What You Get? Enhancing Methodological Transparency in Management Research. *Academy of Management Annals*, *12*(1), 83–110. <https://doi.org/10.5465/annals.2016.0011>
- Ahl, H., & Marlow, S. (2012). Exploring the dynamics of gender, feminism and entrepreneurship: advancing debate to escape a dead end? *Organization*, *19*(5), 543–562. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1350508412448695>
- Annelin, A., & Boström, G. O. (2022). An assessment of key sustainability competencies: a review of scales and propositions for validation. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, *24*(9), 53–69. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-05-2022-0166>
- Battisti, E., Graziano, E. A., Pereira, V., Vrontis, D., & Giovanis, A. (2023). Talent management and firm performance in emerging markets: a systematic literature review and framework. *Management Decision*, *61*(9), 2757–2783. <https://doi.org/10.1108/MD-10-2021-1327>
- ChoudhuryKaul, S., Supriyadi, O., & Fahlevi, N. (2023). Muslim Indonesian women entrepreneurs: a factor analysis of business performance. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2022-0036>
- Christofi, M., Leonidou, E., & Vrontis, D. (2017). Marketing research on mergers and acquisitions: a systematic review and future directions. *International Marketing Review*, *34*(5), 629–651. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMR-03-2015-0100>
- Cinar, K., & Kose, T. (2018). The Determinants of Women’s Empowerment in Turkey: A Multilevel Analysis. *South European Society and Politics*, *23*(3), 365–386. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13608746.2018.1511077>
- Cosentino, A., & Paoloni, P. (2021). Women’s Skills and Aptitudes as Drivers of Organizational Resilience: An Italian Case Study. *Administrative Sciences*, *11*(4),

129. <https://doi.org/10.3390/admsci11040129>
- Da Costa, L. S., Munhoz, I. P., Pereira, L., & Santos Akkari, A. C. (2022). Assessing the digital maturity of micro and small enterprises: A focus on an emerging market. *Procedia Computer Science*, 200, 175–184. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2022.01.216>
- Esubalew, A. A., & Raghurama, A. (2020). The mediating effect of entrepreneurs' competency on the relationship between Bank finance and performance of micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs). *European Research on Management and Business Economics*, 26(2), 87–95. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iedeen.2020.03.001>
- Fazal, S. A., Al Mamun, A., Ahmad, G. Bin, & Al-Shami, S. S. A. (2022). Entrepreneurial Competencies and Microenterprises Sustainability. *Vision*, 26(1), 39–47. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0972262920983997>
- Guzman, J., & Kacperczyk, A. (Olenka). (2019). Gender gap in entrepreneurship. *Research Policy*, 48(7), 1666–1680. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2019.03.012>
- Johari, S. F. A., Rashid, U. K., Safian, E. E. M., & Nasuredin, J. (2023). Conceptualizing Entrepreneurial Competencies (Ec) and Entrepreneurial Orientation (Eo) of Women-Owned SMES Performance. *Social Science Journal*, 13(1), 3806-3817.
- Kim, B. (2023). Three Actors of Entrepreneur Mentoring and Their Impact on Perceived Mentoring Effectiveness: The Korean Formal Mentoring Context. *Global Business Finance Review*, 28(1), 33–46. <https://doi.org/10.17549/gbfr.2023.28.1.33>
- Kruger, S., & Steyn, A. A. (2021). A conceptual model of entrepreneurial competencies needed to utilise technologies of Industry 4.0. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Innovation*, 22(1), 56–67. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1465750320927359>
- Laras, T., Jatmiko, B., Dwiwinarno, T., & Kusumawati, I. F. (2023). Small And Medium Enterprises Performance Impact on Work Culture and Competence with Motivation as A Moderating Variable. *Quality - Access to Success*, 24(193), 130–139. <https://doi.org/10.47750/QAS/24.193.15>
- Lee, C., Wu, C., & Jong, D. (2022). Understanding the Impact of Competitive Advantage and Core Competency on Regional Tourism Revitalization: Empirical Evidence in Taiwan. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13(May), 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.922211>
- Marlow, S., Henry, C., & Carter, S. (2009). Exploring the Impact of Gender upon Women's Business Ownership. *International Small Business Journal: Researching Entrepreneurship*, 27(2), 139–148. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0266242608100487>
- Martini, T. (2018). Kompetensi Usaha Mikro Kecil & Menengah (Umkm) Kota Bandung Dalam Menghadapi Persaingan Masyarakat Ekonomi Asean (Mea). *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan*, 17(3), 220–235. <https://doi.org/10.17509/jpp.v17i3.9616>
- Movono, A., & Dahles, H. (2017). Female empowerment and tourism: a focus on businesses in a Fijian village. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 22(6), 681–692. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2017.1308397>

- Olazo, D. B. (2023). Marketing competency, marketing innovation and sustainable competitive advantage of small and medium enterprises (SMEs): a mixed-method analysis. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 35(4), 890–907. <https://doi.org/10.1108/APJML-01-2022-0050>
- Radaelli, G., & Sitton-Kent, L. (2016). Middle Managers and the Translation of New Ideas in Organizations: A Review of Micro-practices and Contingencies. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 18(3), 311–332. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijmr.12094>
- Sadrnabavi, F., & Daneshvar, H. (2023). Lived experiences of successful women entrepreneurs (SMEs) in Iran: a feminist phenomenological study. *Qualitative Research in Financial Markets*, 15(5), 712–731. <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRFM-12-2021-0198>
- Setyaningrum, R. P., Norisanti, N., Fahlevi, M., Aljuaid, M., & Grabowska, S. (2023). Women and entrepreneurship for economic growth in Indonesia. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13(January), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.975709>
- Smith, S. (2014). Limitations to equality: Gender stereotypes and social change. *Juncture*, 21(2), 144–150. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2050-5876.2014.00795.x>
- Sousa, C. M. P., Martínez-López, F. J., & Coelho, F. (2008). The determinants of export performance: A review of the research in the literature between 1998 and 2005. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 10(4), 343–374. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2370.2008.00232.x>
- Spencer, L. ., & Spencer, S. (1993). *Competence at Work: Models for Superior Performance*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Sujarwo, S., Trisanti, T., & Kusumawardani, E. (2022). Digital literacy model to empower women using community-based education approach. *World Journal on Educational Technology: Current Issues*, 14(1), 175–188. <https://doi.org/10.18844/wjet.v14i1.6714>
- Susantiningrum. (2018). Pemetaan Permasalahan Yang Dihadapi Oleh Usaha Kecil Menengah (UKM) dan Alternatif Solusinya. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Administrasi Perkantoran (SNPAP) 2018*, 229–234. <https://jurnal.uns.ac.id/snpap/article/view/27958/21810>
- Taipale Erävala, K., Lampela, H., & Henttonen, K. (2019). Entrepreneurial competencies in successfully innovative SMEs. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, 38(3), 251. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJESB.2019.10025041>
- Tedmanson, D., Verduyn, K., Essers, C., & Gartner, W. B. (2012). Critical perspectives in entrepreneurship research. *Organization*, 19(5), 531–541. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1350508412458495>
- Timotius, E. (2023). The role of innovation in business strategy as a competitive advantage: Evidence from Indonesian MSMEs. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 21(1), 92–106. [https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21\(1\).2023.09](https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21(1).2023.09)
- Tran, L., & Walter, P. (2014). Ecotourism, gender and development in northern Vietnam. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 44, 116–130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2013.09.005>
- Vrontis, D., & Christofi, M. (2021). R & D internationalization and innovation: A systematic review, integrative framework and future research directions. *Journal*

of Business Research, 128, 812–823. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.03.031>
Yunita, F., & Retnandasari, N. D. (2022). *Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Pemberdayaan dan Pengembangan UMKM bagi Pelaku UMKM Orang Asli Papua di Kota Jayapura Provinsi Papua* [Universitas Gadjah Mada]. <https://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/penelitian/detail/216188>



© 2023 by the authors. Licensee JPPD, Indonesia. This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).